RAJYA SABHA

Wednesday, the 19th March 1986/ 28 Phalguna 1907 (Saka)

The House met at eleven of the Clock, **Mr. Chairman** in the Chair.

ORAL ANSWERS TO QUESTIONS

Publication of dictionaries by the Central Hindi Directorate

*341. SHRI M. KADHARSHA: Will the Minister of HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT be pleased to state:

(a) whether it is a fact that dictionaries in Hindi and other regional languages are being published by the Central Hindi Directorate;

(b) if so, how many volumes of the dictionaries have so far been brought out;

(c) how many volumes of the dictionaries are under print/preparation and since when; and

(d) what are the reasons for delay in bringing out the above volumes?

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE DEPARTMENTS OF EDUCATION AND CULTURE (SHRIMATI SUSHILA ROHATGI): (a) Yes, Sir.

(b) to (d) A statement is laid on the Table of the House.

Statement

In all, the project involved the preparation and production of 99 volumes of 51 bilingual, trilingual and multilingual dictionaries. 13 volumes of 11 dictionaries have already been printed. Of the remaining, 9 volumes of 6 dictionaries are under print. 29 volumes of 13 dictionaries are ready for print, and manuscripts of 12 volumes of 4 dictionaries are under preparation.

While the work on the preparation of trilingual dictionaries was begun in 1971-72, that on bilingual dictionaries was commenced in 1976-77.

This is an ambitious project. This work has to be done with the help of experts who are not only proficient in Hindi and/or English, but also in various modern Indian Languages. The preparation of dictionaries is a highly technical and complex task, involving identification of the basic entries that should be made in Hindi and/or English; identification of equivalents in more than one modern Indian language; and vetting, editing, proof reading, etc. These tasks have to be undertaken in successive stages and cannot be taken up simultaneously. Further, it was difficult to locate presses which had the facility of printing in more than two scripts. These presses had to be identified by following the usual governmental procedure of inviting quotations, etc.

SHRI M. KADHARSHA: Sir, the normal practice is that when a project is taken up, the time-frame of its completion is predetermined. But I am sorry to say that the delay is beyond imagination in this project. Therefore, I want to know from the hon. Minister the time-frame of the project for bilingual and trilingual dictionaries, the total amount earmarked, the amount spent so far, the names of the printers, the amount paid to the printers during the current financial year and whether their capability was assessed before assigning the job of printing or whether it was purely on the whims and fancies of the Directorate of Hindi.

SHRIMATI SUSHILA ROHATGI: Sir, I must congratulate the hon. Member for putting so many questions in one question. Regarding the first part of the question, I would like to say that the delay is not beyond imagination first and foremost because, Sir, this is a very ambitious project and it is being done with the help of experts, not only who are proficient in Hindi or English but also in various other modern Indian languages. We have to look for the experts who really have the expertise and the knowledge of vari-

ous languages. The preparation of dictionaries is a highly technical and complex task which, I think, the hon. Member will appreciate. It requires identification of the basic entries that should be made in Hindi and English, identification of the equivalent words in more than one modern Indian language. Then the vetting has to be done and the editing has to be done. There is proof-reading, etc. There are so many stages which cannot be taken up at the same time, but only one after the other. Therefore, they cannot be taken up simultaneously. Further, I would also like to say that it is difficult to locate the presses which can take up the work in more than two languages. Therefore, sometimes we have to go on looking for presses. After that, we go according to the Government procedure of inviting quotations. Once we had to call the quotations even three times before we could really come to a final decision and locate the right press.

SHRI M. KADHARSHA: What is the total money earmarked? This is yet another instance of the stepmotherly attitude of the Government towards our national languages other than Hindi because the Government is spending crores of rupees on Hindi alone. Why should there be a Directorate of Hindi only and why not a Directorate for Tamil, Telugu, Kannada or for that matter, Punjabi and Marathi? Then in contravention of the promise given by late Panditji, Government is imposing Hindi covertly and overtly and the imperialistic designs of Hindi will be stalled at any cost by the non-Hindi speaking people.

MR. CHAIRMAN: No speech.

SHRI M. KADHARSHA: I would like to know from the hon. Minister whether all languages will be given the same treatment and whether the Directorate of Hindi is having a separate cell for each language and why it is difficult for the Directorate to find experts in other languages. What is the reason?

SHRIMATI SUSHILA ROHATGI: First and foremost, I would like to say that there is no intention to impose Hindi. Nor are there any imperialistic designs behind this idea or the concept of dictionaries. For the information of the hon. Member I would like to say that the statement very clearly lays down that certain dictionaries have been prepared and they are ready. He would not like me to repeat the numbers which have already been given out. Regarding the dictionaries that have already been printed, I would like to say that one multilingual dictionary has already been completed. The multilingual dictionary, contains 5000 entries besides Hindi and equivalents in 13 Indian languages in Davnagri script. It does not exclude the other Indian languages either in the North or in the South. Sir, regarding the trilingual dictionaries, that is, Hindi-Gujarati, Hindi-Malayalam, Hindi-Kannada, and Hindi-Tamil, all these have been made ready and they have already been printed. Regarding others, some are in the process of being printed or manuscripts are there. Therefore, this question should not arise or this doubt should be allayed. There is no such intention on the part of the Government

MR. CHAIRMAN: There are more than ten Members who want to put supplementaries on this question. Therefore, I am reducing the time for the supplementaries and I am allowing only one minute for each supplementary. Yes, Mr. J. P. Yadav.

श्री जगदम्बी प्रसाद यादव : मैं यह पूछना चाहता हूं कि 99 खण्ड तैयार करने में उसमें से कुछ तो तैयार हो गये थे और अभी 36 खण्ड पर कोई काम नहीं हुआ है । एक बात मैं यह पूछना चाहता हुं कि उसको कब तक कम्पलीट करने की बात है ? दूसरी बात यह जानना चाहता हूं कि भारत की जितनी भाषाएं हैं वे सभी हमारी राष्ट्रीय भाषाएं हैं और सभी भाषाओं की जब तक

डिक्शनरी तैयार नहीं हो जाती तब तक भाषा को जानने की सुविधा प्राप्त नहीं हो सकती । सर्वप्रथम 1971-72 में जब तीन भाषाओं की डिक्शनरी का काम शुरु हुआ था उसके शुरु हुए भी 15-16 वर्ष हो गये हैं...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Your time is up. Everybody wants a chance.

श्री जगदम्बी प्रसाद यादव : मैं यह जानना चाहता हू कि राष्ट्रीय भाषाओं को एक दूसरे के सम्पर्क मे लाने के लिए यह जो काम किया जा रहा है उसको कितनी जल्दी तैयार करके देने वाले हैं ?

श्रीमती सुशीला रोहतगी : मान्यवर मैं मानती हू इस कार्य में अतिशीघ्रता होनी चाहिए । जैसा मैंने पहले कहा कि हमने कोई 99 वाल्यूम तैयार करने थे जिसमें से कई एक तैयार हो गये हैं और 36 अभी बाकी हैं । 1979 में एक रिकमेंडशन की गई थी, वैल्युएशन करने के उपरान्त वहां पर निर्णय लिया गया था कि जो कार्य कभी प्रारम्भ हो चुका है पहले उसको समाप्त कर लिया जाए और उसके बाद दूसरे कार्यों को हाथ में लिया जाए । हमें पूरी आशा है कि सातवीं पंचवर्षीय योजना में शायद यह कार्य समाप्त हो सकेगा । मैं आपके समक्ष यह भी कहना चाहती हू कि इस प्रकार 99 वाल्यूम तैयार करने के लिए आथर्स की जरूरत पड़ती है और आथर्स भी ऐसे हों जिनकी मान्यता हो जिनके सुझाव सर्वमान्य हों । इनको ढूंढने के लिए थोड़ा समय और सब्र की आवश्यकता है ।

श्री बी० सत्यनारायण रेड्डी : मंत्री महोदय ने अभी कहा कि हिन्दी की डिक्शनरीज तैयार करने में एक्सपर्ट की जरूरत है । इसमें साइंटिफिक तरीके से जांच करने की भी जरूरत पड़ रही है इसीलिए इस चीज मे कुछ विलम्ब हो रहा है । उन्होंने यह भी बताया कि इसमें से कुछ तैयार हो गई हैं । इसके साथ-साथ मंत्री महोदया ने यह भी कहा है कि जो प्रान्तीय भाषाएं हैं हिन्दुस्तान की उसमें भी कुछ डिक्शनरियां तैयार हो रही है । कुछ के नाम भी लिये उन्होंने । मैं मंत्री महोदया का इस बात की तरफ ध्यान दिलाना चाहता हूं कि तेलुगु न सिर्फ हिन्दुस्तान की दूसरे दर्जे की भाषा है, हिन्दी के बाद इसका नम्बर आता है और यह हिन्दी के बाद दूसरे नम्बर पर बोली जाने वाली भाषा है इसके साथ ही यह संसार में चौथे नम्बर की भाषा है । हिन्दी तीसरे नम्बर की भाषा है और यह चौथे नम्बर की भाषा है...

MR. CHAIRMAN: What is your question?

श्री बी० सत्यनारायण रेड्डी : मैं यह जानना चाहता हू कि हिन्दी के साथ साथ तेलुगु में भी यह डिक्शनरी तैयार हो रही है या नहीं ? अगर नहीं हुई तो कब तक होगी ?

श्रीमती सुशीला रोहतगी : मान्यवर, जहां तक तेलुगु का सम्बन्ध है मैं यह बताना चाहती हू कि तेलुगु की डिक्शनरी अंडर-प्रिंट है और जनवरी, 1986 में प्रिंट के लिये चली गई है । यह जो प्रश्न आपका है कि यह कब तक होगा इसके बारे में यही कहना चाहती हू कि इसमें शीघ्रता की जायेगी ।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr. Mohanarangam.

SHRI R. MOHANARANGAM: Sir, before I began to ask my question I want a clarification. This is from Hindi to Tamil, Hindi to Taluga or Hindi to Bengali or it is in different languages separately? This is the clarification I want. This is only a clarification and this is not a question.

SHRI P. V. NARASIMHA RAO: Sir, in order to help the Member...

SHRI R. MOHANARANGAM: Pardon me, Sir?

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Mohanarangam, you put your question along with your clarification.

SHRI R. MOHANARANGAM: No, Sir. This is very ambiguous.

SHRI P. V. NARASIMHA RAO: Sir, in order to help the honourable Member put his supplementary properly, I would like to tell him that it is both ways Hindi-Tamil, English-Tamil-Hindi-English-English comes last-end, so, a trilingual dictionary is both ways. It is not just Hindi being translated into Tamil—English is only a medium—but it is Tamil into English and so on and that is how it is done: 12 dictionaries one way, 12 dictionaries in another way. This is how it is being done.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Mohanarangam, your time is over now.

SHRI R. MOHANARANGAM: Sir, on the basis of the answer given by the Minister to my clarification, I would like to raise a question. You know it very well, Sir, that I come from Tamil Nadu. I have a hoary language called Tamil in which my forefathers spoke. Our poets have given sermons and scriptures. We do not know when such a fine and hoary language was born. Let the Minister touch his heart and tell me whether it is possible to translate Tamil Language into Hindi language? Sir, Hindi is not such a language to be translated from Tamil or any other languages. I want to know which experts he has consulted for translating Tamil to Hindi?

SHRI P. V. NARASIMHA RAO: Sir, I know that Mr. Mohanarangam speaks Telugu much better on a point of information. The reason for the delay is that we do not have too many persons who can do translation as perfectly as we want them. Now, Sir, I would like to show the House the format of this book of the 14 languages, covering one word being translated into 13 equivalents. The shades of meanings in our Indian languages as well as in English, these being so many, it is just not possible to strike the correct shade. In fact, I would like to add that even these dictionaries would have to be updated constantly. I have gone through some of these, Sir, there may be a difference of opinion on the translation, the exact shade of meaning rendered by a particular word in a particular language. So, I suppose that hereafter we will have to take recourse to computers and so on, so that one version is ready, that is, all the time, as we update them. We do it through word processing and this is a long, long work. This is a laborious work. I have some personal experience. I worked on the Committee which prepared the glossary of words in Telugu only, legal and administrative words and not the whole thing. It took six years. I can assure the House that we are working as hard as any conscientious worker could be working. Sir, I was a MLA at that time, we found we could not complete it before six years. This is a time consuming process. I would appeal to the Members not to ask for the time framework in this. They can ask me whether it has been done properly or not? That is the proper question to ask.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, Mr. Sukomal Sen. We will go to Bengal now.

SHRI SUKOMAL SEN: Sir, I understand that bilingual dictionaries means Hindi plus another language and trilingual means Hindi plus English and another language. Now, I would like to know in the preparation of these dictionaries, actually how many Indian languages are being covered? Whether all the 14 languages are covered or some are left out?

SHRI P. V. NARASIMHA RAO: Sir, how can we leave out any language. We are covering all the 14 languages. If the hon. Member wants to see the format of this book of the 14 languages, I can show it to him.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Yes, you have already mentioned it. Mr. D. C. Prashant. We will go to Kashmir.

श्री धर्मचन्द्र प्रशान्त : सभापति महोदय, मैं माननीय मंत्री जी से पूछना चाहता हूं कि जो शब्द कोष छप चुके हैं तो वे किस भाषा के हिन्दी में छपे

हैं, वह भाषा कौन सी है और जो छप रहे हैं वह कौन सी भाषा के है, जिनका अनुवाद हिन्दी मे हुआ है ?

श्रीमती सुशीला रोहतगी : मान्यवर, पहले तो मैं सदस्यों को धन्यवाद दूंगी कि उन्होंने इस प्रश्न के माध्यम से सारे देश का भ्रमण कर लिया है ।

जहां तक यह रहा कि किस भाषा में से कितना अनुवाद हुआ है तो यह स्टेटमेंट में पहले ही रखा जा चुका है और इसकी संख्या भी दे दी गई है और भाषा के बारे में भी बताया गया है । कुछ भाषाओं के तैयार हो गये हैं और कुछ भाषाओं में तैयार हो रहे हैं । 36 के मामले मे अभी हम कुछ नहीं कर सके है । पहले हम प्रारम्भिक चीज को समाप्त करेंगे और फिर इन 36 वाल्यूम्स को लेना चाहते हैं ।

डा० (श्रीमती) सरोजिनी महिषी : राष्ट्रभाषा का शब्द कोश बनाने का काम जो है जरूर इसमें कठिनाइयां हैं । लेकिन फिर भी यह करना ही है और इसी दृष्टि से मैं पूछना चाहती हूं कि हर एक भाषा में किसी एक व्यक्ति को इसकी जिम्मेदारी सौंपी गई है या किसी समिति को इसकी जिम्मेदारी सौंपी गई है ? इस पर कुल धनराशि कितनी खर्च हो चुकी है और हर भाषा पर कुल कितनी धनराशि खर्च होने वाली है ?

श्री पी० वी० नरसिंहराव : मान्यवर, ये आंकड़े हम दे सकते है । लेकिन मैं जो कह रहा था वह यही है कि धनराशि का इतना महत्व नहीं है । इसमें पैसे की कोई कमी नही पड़ेगी । हमको देखना पड़ेगा कि यह काम कितना अच्छा और कितना बढ़िया हो रहा है । इसलिये समय इसमें लगेगा । मैं आश्वासन देना चाहता हूं कि धनराशि के मामले में कोई कमी नहीं रहेगी और जिस प्रकार से काम हो रहा है जिस पद्धति मे काम हो रहा है उसमें अगर कोई सुझाव माननीय सदस्यों के हों तो हम लेने के लिए तैयार हैं । यह कोई ऐसी पत्थर की लकीर नहीं है कि इसी तरह से हो या किसी दूसरी तरह से नहीं हो । इसमें कोई कमी होगी तो आप सुझाव दीजिये हम उनको धन्यवाद लेंगे ।

श्री राम चन्द्र विकल : सभापति जी, मैं यह कहना चाहता हूं कि हिन्दी के बारे में यह शिकायत थी कि विज्ञान के शब्द हिन्दी में नहीं आते है । हैदराबाद में एक कालेज में विज्ञान का शब्दकोश हिन्दी में तैयार हुआ है क्या माननीय मन्त्री जी को इसका ज्ञान है ? यदि मन्त्री जी को जानकारी है तो वे इसके प्रचार और प्रसार के लिए क्या कर रहे हैं ?

श्री पी० वी० नरसिंह राव : सभापति जी, जहां-जहां हिन्दी में विषय पढ़ाया जाएगा वहां उन पारिभाषिक शब्दों का प्रयोग होगा । मुश्किल यह हो रही है कि इतनी शब्दावली के बनने के बाद भी हम अपने कारोबार में उसका कम प्रयोग करते हैं । हम अंग्रेजी शब्द ले आते है क्योंकि हमारी धारणा होती है कि अंग्रेजी को ज्यादा लोग समझते हैं क्योंकि नई शब्दावली थोड़ी संस्कृत प्रचुर होती है इसका प्रचार होने मे जरा समय लगेगा लेकिन यह आएगी जरूर । एक बार एक कनसेप्ट को हम एक भाषा में बांध लेते है उस भाषा के लिए पारिभाषिक शब्द बना लेते हैं तो उसको प्रचलन में आने में थोड़ा समय लगता है लेकिन वह आ कर रहेगा क्योंकि यह बहुत लम्बी बात है इसलिए मैं उस में नही जाना चाहता हूं लेकिन मैं यह अवश्य कहना चाहता हूं कि यह प्रचलन में आएंगे क्योंकि आए बिना उस भाषा में उस विषय को न तो समझाया जा सकता है और न लिखा जा सकता है । हम जितना भी अंग्रेजी का सहारा लेंगे उससे काम नहीं बनेगा, एक हद तक बन सकता है ।

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: Mr. Chairman, Sir, Mr. Mohanarangam has already put the question which I wanted to put. I may be granted a supplementary for some other question